

FY17 Brownfields Assessment Grant Application Debrief Summary for the City of Clinton, SC

Overall -The Community Need and Project Benefits sections were cohesive and well-received. Reviewers had some feedback on the nuts-and-bolts sections of Project Description and Partnerships (see below).

Ranking/ Evaluation Criteria	Comments/Suggestions for Improvement
Community Need	In general, a very strong section. Proximity to residents was not fully covered – alluded to in last full paragraph on Page 3 and in table. Maybe define the distance and/or identify the neighborhood. [The reviewers did not mention as a weakness, but this can tie in with the first section, target area.]
Project Description & Feasibility of Success	<p>-Makes a strong tie to the need for housing, since that is the specific reuse mentioned. For instance, homeless population was mentioned earlier.</p> <p>-Great job on the budget: clearly stated and defined.</p> <p>-Only a small amount of firm leveraging (the SC Municipal Association). Most are potential tax credits that are not currently being realized.</p>
Community Partnerships and Engagement	<p>-Reviewers' comments were that there needs stronger discussion of how the general public (beyond the partner organizations) will be addressed. Also a little light on anything done to date: note that the criteria states "how the community in the target area has provided input from the project inception". [comment was in regard to outreach already conducted]</p> <p>-This includes any job/workforce development programs: reviewers noted that no contact has been made with those partners.</p> <p>-Partner organizations-this section needs to better address the "varied and specific" roles of organizations, if possible. Possibilities may include community, neighbor groups, or other grassroots organizations.</p>
Project Benefits	Strong section, no weaknesses were noted.
Programmatic Capability	No weaknesses were noted for this section.

Section	Criterion	Full Points	Pre-Panel Score	Score Changes	Post-Panel Score
V.A.1.	Community Need	45	45		45
a.	Target Area and Brownfields	15	15		15
<i>a.i.</i>	<i>Community and Target Area Descriptions</i>	5	5		5
<i>a.ii.</i>	<i>Demographic Information and Indicators of Need</i>	5	5		5
<i>a.iii.</i>	<i>Brownfields and Their Impacts</i>	5	5		5
b.	Welfare, Environmental, and Public Health Impacts	15	15		15
<i>b.i.</i>	<i>Welfare Impacts</i>	5	5		5
<i>b.ii.</i>	<i>Cumulative Environmental Issues</i>	5	5		5
<i>b.iii.</i>	<i>Cumulative Public Health Impacts</i>	5	5		5
c.	Financial Need	15	15		15
<i>c.i.</i>	<i>Economic Conditions</i>	5	5		5
<i>c.ii.</i>	<i>Economic Effects of Brownfields</i>	10	10		10
V.A.2.	Project Description and Feasibility of Success	55	41		41
a.	Project Description, Project Timing and Site Selection	30	23		23
<i>a.i.</i>	<i>Project Description and Alignment with Revitalization Plans</i>	17	10		10
<i>a.ii.</i>	<i>Timing and Implementation</i>	13	13		13
b.	Task Descriptions and Budget Table	20	15		15
<i>b.i.</i>	<i>Task Descriptions</i>	15	10		10
<i>b.ii.</i>	<i>Budget Table</i>	5	5		5
c.	Ability to Leverage	5	3		3
V.B.3.	Community Engagement & Partnerships	35	26		26
a.	Engaging the Community	15	10		10
<i>a.i.</i>	<i>Community Involvement Plan</i>	10	5		5
<i>a.ii.</i>	<i>Communicating Progress</i>	5	5		5
b.	Partnerships with Government Agencies	9	9		9
<i>b.i.</i>	<i>Local/State/Tribal Environmental Authority</i>	5	5		5
<i>b.ii.</i>	<i>Other Governmental Partnerships</i>	4	4		4
c.	Partnerships with Community Organizations	9	6		
<i>c.i.</i>	<i>Community Organization Description & Role</i>	5	2		
<i>c.ii.</i>	<i>Letters of Commitment</i>	4	4		
d.	Partnerships with Workforce Development Programs	2	1		1
V.B.4.	Project Benefits	25	25		25
a.	Welfare, Environmental, and Public Health Benefits	13	13		13
b.	Economic and Community Benefits	12	12		12

	<i>Total Score</i>	160	137		137
--	--------------------	-----	-----	--	-----

Section	Criterion	Full Points	Pre-Panel Score	Score Changes	Post-Panel Score
V.A.1.	Community Need	45	43		43
a.	Target Area and Brownfields	15	14		14
<i>a.i.</i>	<i>Community and Target Area Descriptions</i>	5	5		5
<i>a.ii.</i>	<i>Demographic Information and Indicators of Need</i>	5	5		5
<i>a.iii.</i>	<i>Brownfields and Their Impacts</i>	5	4		4
b.	Welfare, Environmental, and Public Health Impacts	15	14		14
<i>b.i.</i>	<i>Welfare Impacts</i>	5	4		4
<i>b.ii.</i>	<i>Cumulative Environmental Issues</i>	5	5		5
<i>b.iii.</i>	<i>Cumulative Public Health Impacts</i>	5	5		5
c.	Financial Need	15	15		15
<i>c.i.</i>	<i>Economic Conditions</i>	5	5		5
<i>c.ii.</i>	<i>Economic Effects of Brownfields</i>	10	10		10
V.A.2.	Project Description and Feasibility of Success	55	43		43
a.	Project Description, Project Timing and Site Selection	30	25		25
<i>a.i.</i>	<i>Project Description and Alignment with Revitalization Plans</i>	17	16		16
<i>a.ii.</i>	<i>Timing and Implementation</i>	13	9		9
b.	Task Descriptions and Budget Table	20	13		13
<i>b.i.</i>	<i>Task Descriptions</i>	15	8		8
<i>b.ii.</i>	<i>Budget Table</i>	5	5		5
c.	Ability to Leverage	5	5		5
V.B.3.	Community Engagement & Partnerships	35	21		21
a.	Engaging the Community	15	10		10
<i>a.i.</i>	<i>Community Involvement Plan</i>	10	5		5
<i>a.ii.</i>	<i>Communicating Progress</i>	5	5		5
b.	Partnerships with Government Agencies	9	5		5
<i>b.i.</i>	<i>Local/State/Tribal Environmental Authority</i>	5	3		3
<i>b.ii.</i>	<i>Other Governmental Partnerships</i>	4	2		2
c.	Partnerships with Community Organizations	9	4		
<i>c.i.</i>	<i>Community Organization Description & Role</i>	5	2		
<i>c.ii.</i>	<i>Letters of Commitment</i>	4	2		
d.	Partnerships with Workforce Development Programs	2	2		2
V.B.4.	Project Benefits	25	25		25
a.	Welfare, Environmental, and Public Health Benefits	13	13		13
b.	Economic and Community Benefits	12	12		12

	<i>Total Score</i>	160	132		132
--	--------------------	-----	-----	--	-----

Section	Criterion	Full Points	Pre-Panel Score	Score Changes	Post-Panel Score
V.A.1.	Community Need	45	45		45
a.	Target Area and Brownfields	15	15		15
<i>a.i.</i>	<i>Community and Target Area Descriptions</i>	5	5		5
<i>a.ii.</i>	<i>Demographic Information and Indicators of Need</i>	5	5		5
<i>a.iii.</i>	<i>Brownfields and Their Impacts</i>	5	5		5
b.	Welfare, Environmental, and Public Health Impacts	15	15		15
<i>b.i.</i>	<i>Welfare Impacts</i>	5	5		5
<i>b.ii.</i>	<i>Cumulative Environmental Issues</i>	5	5		5
<i>b.iii.</i>	<i>Cumulative Public Health Impacts</i>	5	5		5
c.	Financial Need	15	15		15
<i>c.i.</i>	<i>Economic Conditions</i>	5	5		5
<i>c.ii.</i>	<i>Economic Effects of Brownfields</i>	10	10		10
V.A.2.	Project Description and Feasibility of Success	55	48		48
a.	Project Description, Project Timing and Site Selection	30	27		27
<i>a.i.</i>	<i>Project Description and Alignment with Revitalization Plans</i>	17	17		17
<i>a.ii.</i>	<i>Timing and Implementation</i>	13	10		10
b.	Task Descriptions and Budget Table	20	17		17
<i>b.i.</i>	<i>Task Descriptions</i>	15	12		12
<i>b.ii.</i>	<i>Budget Table</i>	5	5		5
c.	Ability to Leverage	5	4		4
V.B.3.	Community Engagement & Partnerships	35	34		34
a.	Engaging the Community	15	15		15
<i>a.i.</i>	<i>Community Involvement Plan</i>	10	10		10
<i>a.ii.</i>	<i>Communicating Progress</i>	5	5		5
b.	Partnerships with Government Agencies	9	8		8
<i>b.i.</i>	<i>Local/State/Tribal Environmental Authority</i>	5	4		4
<i>b.ii.</i>	<i>Other Governmental Partnerships</i>	4	4		4
c.	Partnerships with Community Organizations	9	9		
<i>c.i.</i>	<i>Community Organization Description & Role</i>	5	5		
<i>c.ii.</i>	<i>Letters of Commitment</i>	4	4		
d.	Partnerships with Workforce Development Programs	2	2		2
V.B.4.	Project Benefits	25	25		25
a.	Welfare, Environmental, and Public Health Benefits	13	13		13
b.	Economic and Community Benefits	12	12		12

	<i>Total Score</i>	160	152		152
--	--------------------	-----	-----	--	-----